



**Legislative Assembly  
Province of Alberta**

No. 25

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

First Session

Twenty-Third Legislature

---

---

Wednesday, October 13, 1993

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

**ROUTINE**

**Presenting Petitions**

Ms Hanson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Beverly, presented a petition from 290 Albertans regarding the reinstatement of cuts made to social assistance.

**Tabling Returns and Reports**

Hon. Mr. Thurber, Minister of Public Works, Supply and Services:

Alberta Public Works, Supply and Services, General Revenue Fund, 1993-94  
Committee of Supply Debate, Responses to Questions Raised in the Legislative  
Assembly of Alberta on September 27, 1993

Sessional Paper 628/93

Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, pursuant to the Optometry Profession Act,  
c0-10, s6(4):

Alberta Association of Optometrists, Annual Report 1992

Sessional Paper 80/93

Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, pursuant to the Universities Act, cU-5, s52(5):

Inspection of Animals under the Universities Act, for the fiscal year ending March 31, 1992

Sessional Paper 15/93

Inspection of Animals under the Universities Act, for the fiscal year ending March 31, 1993

Sessional Paper 15A/93

Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, pursuant to the Financial Administration Act, Provincial General Hospitals Act, cF-9, s2(6):

Children's Health Centre of Northern Alberta Financial Statements, March 31, 1993

Sessional Paper 74E/93

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Community Development:

Seniors' Consultation on Fiscal Change, Report to the Minister, Red Deer College, September 18-19, 1993

Sessional Paper 629/93

Library Grants Review Task Force, Report to Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Community Development, September 30, 1993

Sessional Paper 630/93

Letter, dated October 13, 1993, from Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Community Development, to Mrs. Pana, Chairman, Library Grants Review Task Force, regarding a response to the Library Grants Review Task Force

Sessional Paper 631/93

## **Ministerial Statements**

Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Minister responsible for Science and Technology, announced that October 15 to 24, 1993, is Science and Technology Week.

Mr. Decore, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, commented on the statement.

## **Oral Question Period**

During Oral Question Period, Mr. Decore, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, filed the following:

Copy of a page entitled, Edmonton Region District Office Expenditure Reduction/Impacts

Sessional Paper 830/93

Page 9, Education Roundtable Workbook, Fall 1993

Sessional Paper 831/93

During Oral Question Period, Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Member for Edmonton-McClung, filed the following:

Alberta Health - Three Year Business Plan, Overview

Sessional Paper 832/93

### **Statement by the Speaker**

On Thursday last, the Member for Edmonton-Mayfield rose on a point of order. The events giving rise to the point of order were that a Minister was asked a question and in part of his reply he referred to statements made in the past by a Member or Members of the Opposition.

The Member's point was that the use of previous statements by Opposition Members was both irrelevant to the question and tended to provoke debate contrary to Standing Order 23(b) and Beauchesne paragraph 408(2).

There were a number of points of order raised that day, all pertaining to the demeanour of Question Period. The Chair wants to remind Honourable Members, all Honourable Members, of some facts concerning Question Period.

First, Question Period is intended to provide an opportunity for Members to obtain information from Government.

Second, as the Chair stated last week, any Member who is not a member of Executive Council is a private Member and entitled to avail him or herself of Question Period. Question Period is not the exclusive domain of the Opposition. The Members of the Opposition may not like the questions asked by the private Members who support the Government. That does not matter. Obviously, supporters of the Government will ask questions from a different perspective than opponents of the Government. As long as a question falls within the scope of Question Period, a private Member is entitled to ask it.

Third, as to the perceived relevancy or sufficiency of answers, several factors come into play. Unlike other proceedings in the Assembly, the Chair has no prior knowledge of what will be asked in Question Period or of what the answers will be. That being the case, it is primarily up to the Members asking questions and the Ministers answering them to ensure that the questions and answers adhere to the rules, including the rule of relevancy. Similarly, answers given to questions are, by definition, usually spontaneous. This fact, coupled with the principle that a Minister does not have to answer a question means that Ministers have considerable leeway in their answers.

In the same way, the Chair feels it has only limited opportunities to intervene with respect to answers. Even a cursory glance at Beauchesne will show that the rules regarding questions (Beauchesne 407 to 412) are more extensive than those regarding answers (Beauchesne 416 to 420), but that fact results largely from the principle that Ministers do not have to answer questions. In the case of this Assembly, we have the further rule that a Member is allowed a short preamble, a main question, then 2 supplementary questions which flow from the main question and to which there is no preamble. The initiative is taken by the person asking the question. Therefore the person asking the question has the initial responsibility for the tone of the exchange. An inflammatory question will probably get an inflammatory reply.

This brings us back to the point of order raised by the Member for Edmonton-Mayfield. The Chair notes that earlier in Question Period the Member for Edmonton-McClung asked the Premier about statements he had made several weeks earlier (see Hansard, October 7, 1993, page 764). It seems to the Chair that it is just as legitimate for questions to be asked about previous statements as it is for answers to be given in terms of previous statements.

To conclude, Question Period should belong to the Members. The Chair does not believe that the Speaker should spend more time on his feet than Members do on theirs. However, the Chair feels that it is being asked by some Members to intervene more often. Certainly 5, and I reiterate 5, points of order arising from one Question Period would suggest that some Members wish to make the Chair an active participant in Question Period. The Chair continues to resist this notion and warns Members that they might find it counter-productive if the Chair was forced to become more involved more frequently.

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Written Questions**

The following Written Question was rejected:

**Q208** (Mr. Kirkland):

What are the Department of Transportation and Utilities' paving priorities for secondary highways Divisions 6 and 7 of the County of Camrose and for secondary highways in the County of Leduc between August 31, 1993 and January 1, 1998?

## Motions for Returns

The following Motion for Return was agreed to:

**M213.** Moved by Mr. Beniuk:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copies of the latest actuarial valuation report prepared by or for the Workers' Compensation Board (WCB) containing the assumptions which resulted in a reduction in the accumulated deficit of the WCB.

The following Motions for Returns were moved and agreed to as amended:

**M196.** Moved by Mr. Dickson to propose the following motion:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
The list of all alternative measures programs and victim offender reconciliation programs operated by either a department of the Government or a non-profit agency with support from a Government department which have been subject to elimination or reduction of funding from January 1, 1993 to August 31, 1993.

Hon. Mr. Rostad, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, moved that the Motion for Return be amended to read as follows:

The list of all alternative measures programs operated by either a department of the Government or a non-profit agency with support from a Government department which have been subject to elimination or reduction of funding from January 1, 1993 to August 31, 1993.

**M205.** Moved by Mr. Langevin on behalf of Mr. Collingwood:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
With respect to the campground development situated on the south shore of Burnstick Lake, identified as Miscellaneous Lease Application No. MLL 910167, E1/2 2-35-7 W5M, for which the Letter of Intent-Stage III, under the Commercial Tourism and Recreations Leasing Process, was issued on June 16, 1992:

- (1) the business plan and proposed funding for the campground development;  
and
- (2) memoranda by any of the approving government agencies recommending this site for campground development.

Hon. Mr. Evans, Minister of Environmental Protection, moved that the Motion for Return be amended to read as follows:

With respect to the campground development situated on the south shore of Burnstick Lake, identified as Miscellaneous Lease Application No. MLL 910167, E1/2 2-35-7 W5M, for which the Letter of Intent-Stage III, under the Commercial Tourism and Recreations Leasing Process, was issued on June 16, 1992:

- (1) the consolidated Government response to the applicant at the conclusion of State I and Stage II of the Commercial Tourism and Recreations Leasing Process; and
- (2) any permits or licences submitted by the applicant to date in response to requirements stated in the letter of intent.

The following Motions for Returns were defeated:

**M170.** Moved Mr. Bruseker:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copies of the technology agreements between the Government, Magnesium Company of Canada, Magnesium International (Canada) Ltd. and Alberta Natural Gas Company respecting the ownership and use of the technology for the Magnesium Company of Canada facility in High River, Alberta.

**M172.** Moved Mr. Bruseker:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copies of all audited financial statements for Golden Gate Fresh Foods Inc. from January 1, 1989, to December 31, 1991, inclusive.

**M184.** Moved Mr. Dalla-Longa:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copies of all documents prepared for, or on behalf of, the Department of Energy since October 1992, evaluating the costs/benefits of instituting a permanent royalty holiday for crude oil development wells.

**M185.** Moved by Mr. Dalla-Longa:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Any internal studies conducted by or on behalf of the Government since January 1, 1992, relative to the Alberta Royalty Tax Credit's (ARTC), impact on job creation and increasing drilling activity and the feasibility of its retention.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 25

Abdurahman	Hanson	Nicol
Beniuk	Henry	Percy
Bracko	Hewes	Soetaert
Bruseker	Kirkland	Taylor (Redwater)
Chadi	Langevin	Van Binsbergen
Dalla-Longa	Leibovici	Vasseur
Decore	Massey	White
Dickson	Mitchell	Zwozdesky
Germain		

Against the motion: 44

Ady	Gordon	Oberg
Burgener	Haley	Paszkowski
Calahasen	Havelock	Pham
Cardinal	Herard	Renner
Clegg	Hierath	Rostad
Coutts	Hlady	Severtson
Day	Jacques	Smith
Dinning	Jonson	Sohal
Doerksen	Kowalski	Stelmach
Dunford	Laing	Tannas
Evans	Magnus	Thurber
Fischer	Mar	Trynchy
Forsyth	McClellan	West
Friedel	McFarland	Woloshyn
Fritz	Mirosh	

**M186.** Moved by Mr. Dalla-Longa:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copies of the agreements signed between the Government, 540540 Alberta Ltd.  
and Husky Oil pertaining to the \$30 million interest free loan advanced to cover  
the operational shortfalls for the Lloydminster Bi-provincial Upgrader.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 23

Beniuk	Henry	Percy
Bracko	Hewes	Soetaert
Bruseker	Kirkland	Taylor (Redwater)
Chadi	Langevin	Van Binsbergen
Dalla-Longa	Leibovici	Vasseur
Decore	Massey	White
Dickson	Mitchell	Zwodesky
Hanson	Nicol	

Against the motion: 41

Ady	Gordon	Oberg
Burgener	Haley	Paszkowski
Calahasen	Havelock	Pham
Cardinal	Herard	Renner
Clegg	Hierath	Rostad
Coutts	Hlady	Severtson
Day	Jacques	Smith
Doerksen	Jonson	Sohal
Dunford	Kowalski	Stelmach
Evans	Laing	Tannas
Fischer	Magnus	Thurber
Forsyth	Mar	Trynchy
Friedel	McClellan	Woloshyn
Fritz	McFarland	

**M187.** Moved by Mr. Dalla-Longa:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copies of the agreement pertaining to the maximum \$80 million in royalty assistance to be provided by the Government to Suncor Inc. to facilitate expansion of its oil sands operations over the next five years.

**M197.** Moved by Mr. Dickson:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
All working papers, studies and analysis being reviewed by the joint federal-provincial task force examining the issue of child and spousal support to August 31, 1993.



**M203.** Moved by Dr. Nicol:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copy of the contract between Brooks Diagnostics Ltd., Alberta Special Crops and Horticultural Research Centre in Brooks with respect to the company's use of premises and facilities at the Centre, including any agreements or documents pertaining to the rent paid, the use of the Government courier service and use of RITE lines.

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

M209, M211, M212, M214.

## **Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders**

### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 205 Agricultural Resources Conservation Board Act – Dr. Nicol

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was defeated.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 206 Auditor General Amendment Act, 1993 – Dr. Percy

A debate followed.

Mr. Chadi moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

### **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Day, Deputy Government House Leader, at 5:30 p.m., it was agreed that when the Assembly reconvened at 8:00 p.m. they would be in Committee of Supply, and the Speaker left the Chair.

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 13, 1993 – 8:00 P.M.

## **Committee of Supply**

(Day 17 of Main Estimates Consideration)

(Assembly in Committee)

And after sometime spent therein, the Acting Speaker resumed the Chair and Mr. Tannas reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of the Department of Justice and Attorney General, reports progress thereon, and requests leave to sit again.

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

## **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Evans, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:12 p.m. until Thursday, October 14, 1993, at 1:30 p.m.

---

---

Title: Wednesday, October, 13, 1993